

Setti D. Warren Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens Director

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS **NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: August 22, 2013

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202

7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: Donald Lang, Chair

David Morton, Member Leonard Sherman, Alternate

See Attendance List

Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member

Brian Lever, Staff

ABSENT: William Roesner, Member

> Rodney Barker, Member **Donald Tellalian, Alternate**

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with Donald Lang presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were Lang, Wojciechowski, Morton, and Grissom. Alternate member Sherman also voted. Brian Lever acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded. Sherman arrived at 7:10PM and left at 10:00PM.

65-71 Walnut Park - Landmark Review

Suzanne Perry from the Jackson-Walnut Park Schools presented an application to install two flagpoles. Perry stated that the schools desired the poles to identify their location and that they would be located behind an eight-foot brick wall. Perry stated that they had modeled their banners and flagpoles on those used at Newton Country Day School. Staff recommended that the western pole be moved slightly east as to not obstruct the view of the caretaker's cottage from Washington Street. Perry agreed to make such a change. Grissom motioned to approve the proposed flagpoles with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on August 22, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0,

RESOLVED to approve the proposed flagpoles at <u>65-71 Walnut Park</u> as submitted with the following conditions: (1) that the western flagpole be moved so that it is the same distance from Washington Street but in between the caretaker's house and barn so as not to obstruct the view of the caretaker's house from the driveway off of Washington Street and (2) that a revised site plan be reviewed and approved by staff.



Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Alfred Wojciechowski, Member **David Morton, Member** Nancy Grissom, Member Leonard Sherman, Alternate

35 Webster Street - Landmark / Preservation Restriction Review

Adrienne Hartzell from the Newton Cultural Alliance and architect Phi Hong presented final plans for exterior alterations to the building. Hartzell stated that the Alliance was preparing a phased approach to repurposing the building and that a temporary handicap access ramp was needed along with the alteration of an entrance on the west façade to begin partial occupancy of the building. Hong provided information on the changes proposed to the exterior including replicating entrances, removing a portion of the front porch and removing a porch on the west façade, as well as new windows and doors. Hong further stated that the barn was proposed to have a dormer rather than the skylights initially proposed and presented a drawing of the proposed dormer. Hong stated that repair was the priority over replacement in kind with regard to the windows. Hong also described railings and balustrades proposed around the building. Hong stated that the main entrance on the east façade would remain and be repaired. Wojciechowski noted that there were a number of changes proposed to the barn on the east façade in particular to the windows. Grissom asked what the proposed replacement window would be if windows were replaced and Hong responded that they would be wood simulated divided light windows matching existing. Abutter Miles Smith (30 Webster Street) expressed concern regarding the visibility of the proposed elevator override and Hong stated that it would be set back from the edge of the roof and be minimally visible. Grissom motioned to approve the proposed changes with conditions and Sherman seconded.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on August 22, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0 with one recusal,

RESOLVED to approve the exterior alterations at 35 Webster Street as submitted with the following conditions: (1) that the proposed wood balustrades will match each other; (2) that one dormer will be used instead of the proposed skylights on the west barn roof as submitted at the meeting; (3) that the tripletrack windows on the front façade will be repaired and restored; and (4) that final plans will be reviewed and approved by staff prior to issuance of a building permit.

Voting in the Affirmative: Alfred Wojciechowski, Member **David Morton, Member** Nancy Grissom, Member **Leonard Sherman, Alternate**

Recused from Vote: **Donald Lang, Chair**

133 Forest Avenue – Demolition Review

Property owners Ron and Jonathan Gold presented an application to demolish the building. Staff stated that this 1929 Tudor style residence is located in a neighborhood in West Newton of other Tudor style residences as well as Colonial Revival style residences. The architect for the building was Harry Morton Ramsay a Boston based architect who designed a number of residences in Newton during the 1910s through the 1930s. The first owners were Ira and Mildred Ames. Ira was a vice-president of Ames Company, a machinery manufacturer. There has been some demolition and new construction along Forest Avenue, but there is a strong Tudor style architectural context surrounding this property. The building appears to have had few if any exterior alterations and maintains its slate roof, brick and stucco façade, as well as its wood trim. Ron Gold stated that they had reconsidered a full demolition request in favor of constructing additions. Staff stated that since a full demolition request had been filed, that it could be

reviewed and then a partial demolition request reviewed as part of a waiver of the delay, if the property is placed on a demolition delay. Wojciechowski motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Grissom seconding, this motion passed. Commission members then reviewed the proposed changes to the building including side and rear additions. Abutter Mary Kelley (350 Highland Street) expressed concern over the noise of potential demolition and support for additions as an alternative. Wojciechowski suggested that the attached garage addition be recessed five-feet from the front façade. Grissom motioned to approve a waiver of the demolition delay with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>5-0</u>,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 133 Forest Avenue Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Alfred Wojciechowski, Member David Morton, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Leonard Sherman, Alternate

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>5-0</u>,

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay at <u>133 Forest Avenue</u> based upon plans submitted at the meeting for additions with the following conditions: (1) that the attached garage addition be recessed from the front façade five-feet; (2) that aluminum-clad simulated divided lite windows be used; and (3) that final review and approval of plans by staff is required.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Alfred Wojciechowski, Member David Morton, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Leonard Sherman, Alternate

200 Parker Street - Demolition Review

Surveyor Verne Porter presented an application on behalf of the owner to demolish the building. Staff stated that this 1934 Colonial Revival style residence is located in a Thompsonville neighborhood with a variety of architectural styles from the mid-20th century, including Capes, Colonial Revivals, and Ranches. This building was constructed by the Newton Realty Trust a development company and designed by Walter Graymont, a Boston based architect who also designed residences in Newton. The first owners were Spencer and Cornelia Williams, Spencer worked as a salesman. The building appears to have had few if any exterior alterations aside from a couple of new windows and retains its wood shingle siding, brick chimney and wood trim. The surrounding neighborhood context is varied in architectural style and time period, though there is a concentration of mid-20th century residences in the immediate vicinity. Northward along Parker Street there are some early 20th century and 19th century buildings, while southward there are largely mid-20th century buildings and some modern buildings as well. Wojciechowski stated that Parker Street has a delicate architectural style. Other commission members indicated that they felt the building did not warrant being placed on a demolition delay. Sherman motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Grissom seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>4-1</u>,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 200 Parker Street Not Preferably Preserved.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> <u>Voting in the Negative:</u>

Donald Lang, Chair Alfred Wojciechowski, Member David Morton, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member Leonard Sherman, Alternate

8 Cavanaugh Path - Demolition Review

Rick Lipof representing the property owner presented an application to demolish the building. Lipof stated that the building was in disrepair and provided letter in support of demolition. Staff stated that this 1948 Ranch style residence is located within Oak Hill Park, at the end of Cavanaugh Path. The first residents were Irving and Rita Markovsky. Irving worked in produce. The building has had one-story additions added to southeast façade in 1957 and the northwest façade in 1960. Additionally, the building has had vinyl siding added and some of its windows have been replaced. The surrounding neighborhood context consists of Oak Hill Park residences in largely original condition, altered Oak Hill Park residences, and new construction. In the immediate vicinity four properties on Cavanaugh Path have had second floors added substantially altering their character. Commission members discussed the building and surrounding neighborhood context. Sherman motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>5-0</u>,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 8 Cavanaugh Path Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Alfred Wojciechowski, Member David Morton, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Leonard Sherman, Alternate

162 Lowell Avenue - Demolition Review

Property owner Amleto Martocchia presented an application to demolish the building. Staff stated that this circa 1887 Queen Anne / Colonial Revival style residence is located adjacent to the Newtonville Local Historic District boundary. The first owner was Joseph Byers who worked as a clerk in Boston. The building is within the same time period as many of the buildings in the historic district most of which date from the late 19th and early 20th century. The building has had substantial alterations including replacement siding and windows as well as several additions altering the building's character. Staff asked the Newtonville Historic District Commission to comment on the potential demolition and the Commission recommended against placing a Demolition Delay on this building. Staff expressed concern regarding the loss of an historic building adjacent to one of the City's local historic districts as it has the potential to create an "island effect" of historic buildings surrounding by new development. Grissom noted that this building is located between two commercial buildings. Commission members noted the numerous alterations that have occurred to the building. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>5-0</u>,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 162 Lowell Avenue Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Alfred Wojciechowski, Member David Morton, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Leonard Sherman, Alternate

10 Bellevue Street - Demolition Review

Architect Dartagnan Brown presented an application to demolish the building. Staff stated that this 1948 Garrison Colonial Revival style residence is located in a neighborhood with a variety of architectural styles dating from the late 19th century to the mid-20th century. The building was constructed by the Nardone Brothers, a Newton development company and designed by Christopher Crowell, a Newton architect who designed many mid-20th century buildings in the City. The first occupants were Leonardo and Louise Nardone. Leonardo was a partner in Nardone Brothers. The building has had few alterations aside from the addition of vinyl siding. This neighborhood consists of late 19th century residences such as Italianates, Second Empire's and Queen Anne's some with carriage houses that have had their parcels subdivided in the 1920s through the 1950s resulting in interspersed 20th century architectural styles of Colonial Revivals Capes, and Ranches. This building was one of the last constructed along this section of Bellevue Street in the mid-20th century with two residences built later in the 1970s and one in the 1980s. There is a cohesive late 19th century architectural context with the Victorian era residences and carriage houses, but the 20th century buildings are a jumble of sizes some one and a half story and others two and a half story. Additionally, the 20th century buildings have varying setbacks from the street with some forward of others. Commission members discussed the building and neighborhood context. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>5-0</u>,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 10 Bellevue Street Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Alfred Wojciechowski, Member David Morton, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Leonard Sherman, Alternate

49 Hazelhurst Avenue - Demolition Review

Property owner Michael Brusilovsky and architect Yefim Massarsky presented an application to remove the roof and construct a second story addition. Staff stated that this 1958 Contemporary style residence is in a neighborhood of other Cotemporary style residences constructed by Creative Builders and designed by architect Ralph I Williams. This neighborhood was developed by Albemarle Construction. The first owners were Israel and Lillian Chanoc. Israel worked as an engineer. The building appears to have had few alterations. The surrounding neighborhood consists of nearly identical buildings in style, though some have had alterations in siding and windows. Given the amount of demolition proposed this requires review as a partial demolition. The buildings individually are a stock style common to the 1950s and have minimal detailing and unique features. As a set the buildings in this neighborhood are an unusual



collection of 1950s architecture that is rarely found in Newton in such concentration. Morton stated that he felt the context was the only potential reason to place the demolition delay on the building. Wojciechowski asked for clarification regarding the percentage of demolition proposed and Massarsky stated that the roof was proposed to be removed, but the first-story would remain. Commission members discussed the architectural integrity of the building and neighborhood. Massarsky stated that buildings in the neighborhood had had alterations and additions. Wojciechowski motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Grissom seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>4-0 with 1 abstention</u>,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 49 Hazelhurst Avenue Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:
Donald Lang, Chair
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
David Morton, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member

Leonard Sherman, Alternate

Abstaining from Vote:

142 Homer Street - Demolition Review

Property owner Babak Veyssi and architect Kent Duckham presented an application to amend the existing waiver of the demolition delay to move the building and depress it further into the ground. Staff stated that this property consists of an 1874 Second Empire style house and a carriage house. The first owner was Samuel Ward who worked in the stationary business in Boston. The house has had some alterations including an asphalt shingle roof, the addition of a large porch or verandah in the early 20th century, a mudroom addition, as well as new window openings and replacement windows. The building retains its form, style, and decorative trim work around the windows and dormers. The surrounding neighborhood consists of other late 19th century residences, including at the adjacent property 132 Homer Street and early 20th century residences with a few modern buildings as well. Although altered, the building retains significant features as well as an historic neighborhood context.

The Commission placed a demolition delay on the house and carriage house at the June 2012 meeting. At the January 2013 meeting, the Commission approved at waiver of the demolition delay on the house based upon plans for an addition. Veyssi stated that the foundation needed to be replaced and as part of examining that they decided to move the building to allow for more space for the driveway and seek a more level part of the property to use at the rear of the building. Duckham stated that they wished to move the building eight-feet to the west and lower it approximately three-feet into the ground. Commission members expressed concern over lowering the building and having a concrete foundation, where the building presently has a rectangular granite block facing. Morton stated that houses of this era typically had exposed stone foundations and recommended that the building retain its present height and have a stone veneer on the foundation. Alderman Blazar expressed concern regarding the loss of historic details on the building and that in moving the building the view of the carriage house might be obstructed. Alderman Danberg stated that she supported the building having a stone faced foundation and that she was concerned about the effect on the streetscape. Abutter Richard Cohn (132 Homer Street) expressed support for moving the building and concern over protecting existing trees on the property. Wojciechowski motioned to approve moving the building six-feet west with a stone facing on the new foundation with Sherman seconding, this motion was withdrawn. Morton motioned to approve moving the building eight-feet west with conditions and Sherman seconding, this motion passed.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>5-0</u>,

RESOLVED to amend the waiver of the demolition delay approval at 142 Homer Street to move the building eight-feet west with the following conditions: (1) that the height of the building will remain unchanged from the previous approval; (2) that the driveway and retaining wall along the eastern property boundary will be moved two-feet west; (3) that the proposed retaining wall along the proposed driveway be fieldstone; (4) that the new foundation will have a stone veneer to match the existing foundation; and (4) that revised plans be submitted and approved by staff.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Alfred Wojciechowski, Member David Morton, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Leonard Sherman, Alternate

31 Kappius Path – Demolition Review

Property owner Armando Petruzziello presented an application to waive the remainder of the demolition delay at this property based upon plans for a replacement building. Staff stated that this 1948 Ranch style residence is located within Oak Hill Park on the path system. The building retains is original form, but the building now has vinyl siding and the windows have been replaced. The building's first occupants were Jack and Alyce Batten. Jack worked in the real estate business. Buildings in the vicinity are a mix of original Oak Hill Park residences, altered Oak Hill Park residences, and new construction. The property was placed on a demolition delay at the April 2013 meeting; the applicant is seeking a waiver of the remainder of the delay based upon plans for a replacement building. Lang stated that the building was fairly consistent with the guidelines the Commission had established regarding the review of replacement buildings in Oak Hill Park. Abutters and neighbors expressed opposition to the demolition and concern regarding the size of the proposed building, the orientation of the proposed building to the path system, the potential changing of grade, and disrupting the character of the neighborhood. Lang asked if the grade was proposed to be changed and Petruzziello responded that it would not be substantially changed. Wojciechowski suggested adding a door on the rear façade to face the path system. Grissom motioned to issue a waiver of the demolition delay with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>4-0</u>,

RESOLVED to issue a waiver of the demolition delay approval at <u>31 Kappius Path</u> based upon plans submitted with the following conditions: (1) that the building have a four-step front entrance above existing grade; (2) that 6/1 simulated divided light windows be used; (3) that the building have at least one door facing the pathway; (4) that the doorway on the side of the building be eliminated; and (5) that revised plans be submitted and approved by staff.

Voting in the Affirmative: Not Present:

Donald Lang, Chair Leonard Sherman, Alternate

Alfred Wojciechowski, Member David Morton, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member

76 Carlton Road - Demolition Review

Sean Boyle representing the property owner presented an application to waive the remainder of the demolition delay at this property based upon plans for a replacement building. Staff stated that this 1927 Spanish-Eclectic style residence is located in a Waban neighborhood that is predominantly Colonial Revival style of different variants including Garrison, Spanish, and Colonial Revival and Craftsman mixtures. Other architectural styles in the area include Cape and Tudor. The building was designed by H. E. Kellog a Boston



based architect and owned by Dr. Herman and Ella Bumpus. Herman was an instructor in Providence. Buildings of this architectural style are rare in Newton. In most cases these buildings are two stories and variants of Colonial Revival style. This building has unusual ornate features including a miniature bell tower, rafter tails, balconet, a tile roof, and terra cotta block construction with a stucco siding. In scale and massing, this building is also unusual in the neighborhood; however in time period this building is consistent with the area and has details seen on other larger residences. The property was placed on a demolition delay at the April 2013 meeting. Staff also presented letters in opposition to the demolition of the building from abutters. Lang stated that this is an extraordinary building and worthy of preservation. Morton stated that the proposed replacement does not mitigate the loss of the building. Wojciechowski motioned to deny a waiver of the demolition delay with Grissom seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>August 22, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to deny a waiver of the demolition delay at <u>76 Carlton Road</u> based upon plans submitted with the Commission recommending a preservation approach including renovation and/or an addition to the existing building.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Not Present:

Donald Lang, Chair Alfred Wojciechowski, Member David Morton, Member Nancy Grissom, Member **Leonard Sherman, Alternate**

Administrative Discussion:

Minutes

The July 2013 meeting minutes were approved unanimously with Wojciechowski abstaining.

Accessory Building Preservation

Staff presented a draft ordinance for an expedited review regarding the conversion of carriage houses and barns into accessory apartments as a means to incentivize their preservation. Commission members stated that they would review the draft and provide comments.

Meeting adjourned 11:15 PM